Galactica Media: Journal of Media Studies. 2024. No 4 | ISSN: 2658-7734
Cinema Studies | https://doi.org/10.46539/gmd.v6i4.480

A Feminist Critical Discourse Analysis of French and Turkish Dubbings of "Mona Lisa Smile" Movie

Tuğçe Elif Taşdan Doğan[1] & Merve Ergüney[2]

Samsun University. Samsun, Türkiye

Received: 15 February 2024 | Revised: 9 July 2024 | Accepted: 15 July 2024

Abstract

This study analyzes the original version, Turkish and French dubbings of the movie Mona Lisa Smile, through the Feminist Critical Discourse Analysis (FCDA) method. The study aims to reveal the potential of the Turkish and French dubs of the movie to reproduce gender stereotypes towards women. The movie was chosen through purposive sampling, one of the non-random sampling methods. The observation-notetaking technique was used as the data collection method.10 examples were determined. These discourses were analysed through the FCDA method by comparing the original version with its French and Turkish dubs on the Netflix platform. Gender-based discourses were seen to be preserved in all examples in the French language. In Turkish dubbing, serious losses occurred in all examples from the perspective of gender roles. This study is the first research evaluating the French and Turkish dubbings of an audiovisual product through FCDA; therefore, it presents authentic data for future studies.

Keywords

Audiovisual Translation; Hollywood; Mona Lisa Smile; Feminist Critical Discourse Analysis; Dubbing

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons "Attribution" 4.0 International License

1 Email: elif.tasdan[at]samsun.edu.tr ORCID https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4777-3575
2 Email: merve.erguney[at]samsun.edu.tr ORCID https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1397-5769

Galactica Media: Journal of Media Studies. 2024. No 4 | ISSN: 2658-7734
Исследования кинематографа | https://doi.org/10.46539/gmd.v6i4.480

Феминистский критический дискурс-анализ французского и турецкого дубляжей фильма «Улыбка Моны Лизы»

Ташдан Доган Тугче Элиф[1] & Эргюней Мерве[2]

Самсунский университет. Самсун, Турция

Рукопись получена: 15 февраля 2024 | Пересмотрена: 9 июля 2024 | Принята: 15 июля 2024

Аннотация

В данном исследовании анализируются оригинальная версия фильма «Улыбка Моны Лизы» и его турецкий и французский дубляжи методом феминистского критического дискурс-анализа (FCDA). Цель исследования — выявить, в какой степени турецкий и французский дубляжи фильма воспроизводят гендерные стереотипы в отношении женщин. Фильм был выбран методом целенаправленной выборки, который относится к нерепрезентативным методам отбора. Для сбора данных использовалась техника наблюдения с фиксацией заметок, на основе которой было отобрано 10 примеров. Эти дискурсы были проанализированы методом FCDA, путем сравнения оригинальной версии с французским и турецким дубляжами на платформе Netflix. В примерах на французском языке гендерно обусловленные дискурсы сохранялись во всех случаях. В турецком дубляже наблюдаются значительные потери в передаче гендерных ролей во всех примерах. Это исследование является первым, в котором оценены французский и турецкий дубляжи аудиовизуального продукта с помощью FCDA; следовательно, оно предоставляет уникальные данные для будущих исследований.

Ключевые слова

аудиовизуальный перевод; Голливуд; Улыбка Моны Лизы; феминистский критический дискурс-анализ; дубляж

Это произведение доступно по лицензии Creative Commons “Attribution” («Атрибуция») 4.0 Всемирная

1 Email: elif.tasdan[at]samsun.edu.tr ORCID https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4777-3575
2 Email: merve.erguney[at]samsun.edu.tr ORCID https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1397-5769

Introduction

The act of translation is the transfer of the form and meaning in one language to their equivalences in another. Since the 1970s, there has been an increasing interest in the discipline known as Translation Studies. These studies have long addressed questions such as fidelity to the source text and equivalence with the source language, the loss of nuances in the act of translation, and the language strategies employed by translators (De Marco, 2006). Considering the functions of language, analyses based solely on the linguistic features of the text are insufficient in translation studies, and it becomes important to examine the text with different methods in a way to analyse its social, cultural, and ideological subtexts. Accordingly, language and translation are nowadays seen as tools for gender oppression or freedom, as they can confirm or challenge the status quo. Numerous academic studies produced in these two disciplines over the past thirty years have emphasized the role of language and translation in the construction of the social world. In particular, attention has been paid to how gender roles are discursively constructed through language and translation (Castro 2013, p. 5–6).

The social functions of language and translation also apply to audiovisual products. These products not only occupy a large part of our lives but also shape our worldview. They provide multi-channel and multi-layered communication that appeals to both the eye and the ear. Thanks to these features, audiences feel as if they are interacting with the audiovisual products, which results in intense information transfer from them (Okyayuz & Kaya, 2017, p. 51). Multilingual audiovisual products can reach much wider audiences, which naturally requires comprehensive analyses of their translated versions (Okyayuz, 2022, p. 1305). Therefore, studies on the translation of these products have significantly increased with the widespread use of audiovisual products such as advertisements, TV series, video content, and feature films. Of all products, especially cinema is an extremely important mass media in terms of representing and guiding society in many ways.

The relationship between cinema and translation is of great importance in the context of the intercultural transfer of the general tendencies and dominant mindset of society through audiovisual art products. Considering the importance of gender studies and gender-based discourse analysis, which have come to the forefront, especially in the 21st century, it is necessary to study the use of gendered language in audiovisual products and their translations into different languages. Cinema is a cultural practice in which general assumptions about women and femininity, men and masculinity (and their sexual differences) are produced, reproduced, and represented (Smelik 2008, p. 1). This practice is a result of the norms of the society in which the film is produced and its tendencies in terms of language use. The transfer of these tendencies to other societies is realized through translation; therefore, the gendered mindset and language use are expected to be taken into account in the translation process, and the translation should be faithful

to the underlying mentality and sub-message of the work. Hence, analysing film translations from the perspective of feminist theory is extremely important in terms of revealing ideological subtexts.

This study focuses on the reflections of gender-based discourses in audiovisual products in different societies and languages by comparing the *Mona Lisa Smile* movie's original (English) version with its Turkish and French dubs within the framework of FCDA. The study aims to reveal the potential to produce and reproduce gender stereotypes towards women from a feminist perspective in the Turkish and French dubs of *Mona Lisa Smile*. In this way, it will be analysed how a movie shot in English, which is not a gendered language, is reflected in French, which is a completely gendered language, and in Turkish, a language in which gendered grammatical usages are absent, and it will be discussed to what extent linguistic and cultural differences affect the dominance of ideology in the movie.

Feminism in Audio-Visual Translation Studies

The roots of feminism, which is defined as the belief in ending sexist oppression and seeing men and women as equal in value, date back to the 18th century (Çelik 2022, p. 855). Bell Hooks defines feminism as "a movement that seeks to end sexism, exploitation, and oppression based on sexism" (2012, p. 9).

The application of feminist theory in translation studies developed over thirty years ago through the efforts of a group of Canadian female translators and theorists. Prominent figures such as Lori Chamberlain (1988), Barbara Godard (1989), Sherry Simon (1996) and Luise von Flotow (1991; 1995; 1997) have shed light on feminist approaches to translation studies. These studies have been conducted on different genres of literature. When the relationship between translation and feminism is examined, it is seen that existing studies generally focus on literary works and written texts, and only a few studies are elaborating on the feminist translation analysis for products in different media genres. Especially considering the general trends emerging in the 21st century, it is noticeable that audiovisual products appeal to a large segment of society and have become an effective medium for the transmission of ideology. For this reason, it is of great importance to evaluate feminist ideology through audiovisual products and to examine the effective/limited transfer of this ideology to different cultures through dubbing/subtitling.

As mentioned above, feminist theory and criticism began to appear in literary translation studies in the 1980s, yet the application of feminist theories in audiovisual translation studies has only developed since the early 2000s (von Flotow and Hernández 2018, p. 296). Considering that the interaction between feminism and media studies began in the 1970s (Carter, 2012), it might be stated that feminist-oriented studies in the field of audiovisual translation have developed rather slowly.

In the early 2000s, scholars such as Jorge Díaz Cintas (2004) and Peter Fawcett (2003) called for studies evaluating audiovisual translation from a gender-based

perspective, and the first examples of studies in this field began to emerge in the 2000s. Some of these studies were historical, methodological, and descriptive analyses of audiovisual translation (De Marco 2012; 2018; von Flotow and Hernández 2018); some studies analysed audiovisual products such as cinema (Alfano, 2018; Baumgarten, 2005; De Marco, 2006; Sehyoun, 2017), TV series (Feral, 2011), anime (Josephy, 2017), advertisements (Nardi, 2011) from a gender-based perspective; some were field studies (Gimbert, De Marco and Borrás, 2016a; Gimbert, De Marco and Borrás, 2016b); and some of the studies addressed the differences in the approaches of professional and amateur subtitle translators within the scope of gender issues (Dore and Zarrelli, 2018). Some of these studies included a broader gender focus, and they addressed the feminist issues comprising findings from feminist theory.

Baumgarten (2005) analysed the forms and functions of language-specific textualizations of 'extra-linguistic concepts' from a gender-based perspective by comparing the original language (English) and the German dubs of James Bond movies. De Marco has conducted studies focusing on how the original and dubbed language used in movies affects or is affected by social constructs such as gender. In her study (2006), she analysed the differences between Italian and Spanish dubbed and subtitled translations of three British films, *East is East* (1999), *Bend it like Beckham* (2002), and *Calendar Girls* (2003), from a gender-based perspective, and she aimed to see to what extent translations can shape audiences' understandings of gender. The study revealed that the relevant movie translations contained good examples of linguistic clichés that reveal not only sexist but also general discriminatory attitudes (De Marco, 2006). De Marco's 2012 book entitled *Audiovisual Translation through a Gender Lens* focuses on the role of movie language and audiovisual translation in the transmission of stereotypes related to gender, sexuality, ethnicity, and economic status. The book includes strategies for identifying the gender bias embedded in language and determining how it is manipulated during dubbing (De Marco, 2012). Again, in her 2018 article entitled "The 'engendering' approach in audiovisual translation", De Marco presents a valid methodological framework in which interdisciplinary approaches where gender and translation studies meet can apply to audiovisual translation (De Marco, 2018).

Sehyoun (2017) analysed the Korean subtitles and dubbing of three Disney films, *Mulan*, *The Princess and the Frog*, and *Brave* to explore the characteristics of gender portrayed in audiovisual translation. The study revealed that sexism, gender stereotyping and patriarchal ideas are the main concepts underlying the translational differences in the selected movies.

Alfano (2018) analysed the English subtitles of the Italian movie *Divorce Italian Style* made by two different studios in Italy and the US from a gender-based perspective and he evaluated the findings quantitatively. The study concluded that while the subtitles made by the Italian studio retained the same intensity of sexist discourses, the American version softened these discourses and achieved this change by using feminist translation strategies.

Luise von Flotow and Daniel E. Josephy-Hernández (2018) examined and evaluated historically, methodologically, and descriptively the developments in the application of feminist theory in audiovisual translation studies in their study titled "Gender in Audiovisual Translation Studies Advocating for Gender Awareness".

In the literature review, Feral's study (2011) seems to be the most similar research to our study as it directly addresses the translation of an audiovisual product from the perspective of feminist theory. Feral (2011) analysed the elements of American feminism in *The Sex and the City* series and examined how these elements were rendered in French subtitles and dubbing to show how a feminist perspective can be integrated into audiovisual translation research. The findings of Feral's study reveal that the subtitled versions of the series reflect US feminist references and perspectives whereas the dubs weaken or eliminate the feminist content of the US production as well as make significant changes to the text itself.

All these studies have shed light on the impact of audiovisual translation on producing and reproducing gender stereotypes and especially sexist stereotypes toward women. Nevertheless, it can be stated that there are limited studies in the literature analysing this interdisciplinary field where two rich disciplines such as audiovisual translation and feminist theory come together. In the relevant literature, the researchers have found no study in which translations of motion pictures, which have an extremely important place among audiovisual products in terms of influencing society, are analysed from the perspective of feminist theory. In addition, there is no study in which dubbed/subtitled translations of any audiovisual product have been analysed using the FCDA method. Accordingly, the present study is the first research comparing the original language of a motion picture with both its Turkish and French dubbings through the use of the FCDA method, which demonstrates its significance.

FCDA in Audiovisual Translation: Case Study on *Mona Lisa Smile*

Methodology

Lazar's approach named "Feminist Critical Discourse Analysis" is a significant methodology to investigate the interaction between feminist theory and linguistics. This theory analyses how gender relations are shaped and reproduced by means of language. Especially, feminist approaches in Lazar's study offer an important context to understand how the language-based differences in a specific text or media represent the female characters and how these characters are perceived by the target audience. Therefore, feminist critical discourse analysis plays a critical role in illuminating the reflection and reproduction of cultural and gender-based differences in the translation process. As indicated by Lazar, FCDA enables "to criticize that is, relations of power that systematically privilege men as a social group and disadvantage, exclude and disempower women as a social group" (Lazar, 2007b,

p. 5). According to him, FCDA aims to reveal the hegemonic power relations and sexist attitudes to which women are subjected (Lazar, 2007, p. 142).

In this study, the feminist critical discourse analysis method will be used as an analytical framework. According to FCDA, discourse is considered an element of social practices that has a dialectical relationship between society and discourse (Khan, 2019, p. 251). FCDA is an interdisciplinary method (Lazar 2007, p. 142). It combines critical discourse analysis and feminist insights to interrogate the operation of power and ideology in discourse to maintain gender-based social arrangements (Nartey 2021, p. 658).

This study focuses specifically on Lazar's concept of feminist critical discourse analysis. In the study, the original English language, Turkish and French dubbings of the movie *Mona Lisa Smile* (2003) directed by Mike Newell were compared in light of FCDA. The movie *Mona Lisa Smile*, which was selected as the sample in this study, has a plot that reflects the idea that "women are nothing but good wives and mothers, regardless of their abilities and desires" in American society in the 1950s. This movie provides significant data to be analysed within the scope of Feminist Critical Discourse Analysis because it contains an enriched narration on social themes such as gender roles and perception of female identity. Since this movie reflects the social structure and the social gender norms in the USA in the 1950s, it offers ideal samples to be interpreted within the framework of FCDA. Butler has emphasized that representation of women "seeks to extend their visibility and legitimacy as political subjects" (Butler, 1990, p. 1); accordingly, *The Mona Lisa Smile* is an important resource that represent female identity from a feminist perspective through the discourse used in the scenes.

Observation-note taking technique, one of the data collection techniques, was used in the study. The movie to be analysed was selected by purposive sampling method, which is among non-random sampling methods. In the purposive sampling method, the researcher selects a sample for a specific purpose to get the findings that s/he wants to know or discover (Etikan, Musa, Alkassim, 2016, p. 2).

In the data collection and analysis phase, the researchers preferred to analyse the dubbing of the movie rather than the subtitles because subtitle translations are mostly done by amateur bilinguals with no formal translation training and generally no awareness of ideology in translation. This fact results in a myriad of subtitle options at various levels of proficiency, leading to serious information pollution. On the other hand, dubbing translations are created at a more professional level compared to subtitle translations, considering the costs of embedding and dubbing. In the study, the researchers used the version of the movie released on Netflix, a professional online movie streaming site that is widely watched by the masses, and they analysed its dubbed versions on this platform. In this context, a total of 10 samples were found and evaluated in the scope of FCDA. Firstly, the feminist dialogues in the original language have been transcribed into text and then the French and Turkish translations of the examples have been listed to be evalu-

ated from the perspective of FCDA. The feminist perspectives in the original dialogue and its translated versions have been analysed according to Lazar's FCDA. Other dialogues in the movie are excluded because they do not contain feminist discourses.

About the Movie

Mona Lisa Smile is a 2003 romantic drama film directed by Mike Newell. The movie is about an idealistic teacher, Katherine Watson, who starts teaching Art History at the prestigious, conservative, and all-female Wellesley College in Massachusetts and challenges the social roles assigned to women. In the movie, the social roles, expectations, and impositions placed on female figures in the 1950s are told from a critical perspective and the protagonist's battle against these roles is presented. Therefore, the movie in question is inherently feminist and the effects of this approach are reflected in the characters' speeches. Teacher Katherine Watson's discourses against gender roles and the speeches of some students who internalize these roles are very important in terms of the sub-message of the film.

Data Analysis and Discussion: FCDA on the original version of *Mona Lisa Smile*, and its dubbed versions in French and Turkish

In this section, FCDA has been carried out on the original version of the Hollywood movie Mona Lisa Smile and its dubbed versions in French and Turkish. All 10 examples found in the movie are listed below, and the quality of the transfer of ideology in three different versions of the movie has been discussed from a comparative and critical perspective.

Table 1. Example 1 for FCDA in *Mona Lisa Smile* and its French and Turkish Dubbed Versions

Source Text (ST [English])	• Her companion died in May. • Companion? • You know, companion. (14' 25") (Newell 2003)
Target Text (TT- French)	• Son ami(e) a disparu en mai. • Son ami(e)? • Son ami(e), sa compagne!
Target Text (TT- Turkish)	• Hayat arkadaşı mayıs ayında öldü. • Hayat arkadaşı mı? • Bilirsin, arkadaşı.

In the original version, Nancy Abbey, a professor at Wellesley College, gives information to the protagonist about their roommate, Amanda Armstrong, who works as a nurse at the college. She secretly declares that the "companion" of Amanda Armstrong died. Watson does not understand the hidden message behind

the use of the word "companion", and Nancy Abbey repeatedly utters the very same word with a specific intonation to underline Amanda Armstrong's lesbian identity. After this dialogue, Nancy Abbey talks about Josephine Burns, Armstrong's girlfriend, and she inevitably uses the pronoun "she" in her sentences. Apart from the inevitable use of the feminine pronoun in this dialogue, the use of the word "companion" has important connotations in terms of reflecting the sexual preference of the nurse. When we look at the dictionary meaning of the word "companion", we see that it represents the friendly relationship between two or more people ("Companion," 2023). Apart from the denotational meaning of the word, there is also another meaning defined in legal circumstances: "a companion relationship is a relationship between two adults living together as a couple on a genuine domestic basis, but who are not married or in a de facto relationship" ("Companion Relationship," 2023). Accordingly, the use of the word both creates an ambiguity in the mind of the protagonist and also contains certain underlying meanings about Armstrong's sexual preference. The dialogue is significant because it contributes to the feminist perspective of the movie by reflecting the couple's relationship through the word "companion", using intonation to illustrate Amanda's lesbian identity, and using the "she" pronoun for Josephine.

In French dubbing, it is seen that a different word is used at the beginning of the dialogue. The French language has the exact equivalence of the English word "companion" which is "compagnon" (masculine form of the word) and "compagne" (feminine form). Compagnon/compagne is defined as "the person whom you share your life with (spouse or lover)" ("Compagnon," 2024); therefore, the word already illustrates a couple's relationship between two persons. For this reason, the dialogue starts with the sentence "her friend died in May" (back translation). "Ami" is the masculine form of the word whereas "amie" is the feminine one. However, the pronunciation of both words is identical; therefore, it is almost impossible to understand the sex of the relevant person without any other information. At this point, the use of the word "ami(e)" in the French dubbing creates a similar ambiguity to the original version of the dialogue. After Katherine's question, Abbey changes the word "ami(e)" with the word "sa compagne" (feminine form). The use of this word clarifies that Armstrong's companion is female and that she is lesbian. Since French is a gendered language, the dialogue continues with the use of the pronoun "elle" ("she" in English), which makes the connotation clearer as it is seen in the original version of the movie.

In the Turkish version, however, significant losses have been observed due to the characteristics of the language and the incapacity of the translator to preserve the ideological references in the dialogue. The word "companion" has been translated into Turkish as "hayat arkadaşı" (spouse, partner). This term is only used to define couple's relationship in Turkish and is generally preferred to describe the relationship between a man and a woman; therefore, Turkish audiences cannot understand why the protagonist needs clarification in this dialogue. Apart from

the loss of the message in this part of the dialogue, the explanation part makes the discourse more absurd because Abbey says that "bilirsin, arkadaşı" ("you know, her friend" [back translation]), which turns the relationship into a kind of normal friendship. The so-called clarification does not contain any information about the real nature of the relationship between Amanda and Josephine. Since Turkish does not have gender-specific pronouns, the following sentences also do not give any clue about Amanda's lesbian identity. It is also difficult to understand Josephine's sex for the Turkish audience just by hearing the name because Turkish audiences are not familiar with English names. Therefore, it is almost impossible for Turkish audiences to understand the sexual preferences of Amanda Armstrong.

According to Lazar's FCDA, it can be stated that the original version of the dialogue is important in terms of reflecting a woman's sexual preference which was highly criticized in the 1950s in the USA and that the dialogue aims to illustrate the feminist perspective of the movie. This audiovisual product aims to raise awareness about gender roles in the USA in the 1950s, as stated in the FCDA; therefore, gender-based discourses have utmost importance and it is significant to transfer them into other languages effectively. The French dubbing of the dialogue has efficiently preserved the ideological function of the discourse whereas the Turkish dubbing has eliminated all information demonstrating the different sexual preferences of a woman, which results in a significant loss in the transfer of the ideological message of the movie.

Table 2. Example 2 for FCDA in *Mona Lisa Smile* and its French and Turkish Dubbed Versions

ST (English)	• Do I look a little bit like her? • Like who? • Katherine Watson • You mean "crap is art"? (19' 31") (Newell 2003)
TT- French	• Tu ne trouves pas que je lui ressemble? • A qui? • Katherine Watson • Celle pour qui la merde, c'est de l'art?
TT- Turkish	• Ona biraz benzemiyor muyum? • Kime? • Katherine Watson'a • Bayan ukalaya mı, yani?

In this example, the dialogue occurs between Giselle Levy and Betty Warren, two students at Wellesley College. Highly inspired by Katherine Watson, Giselle wants to look like her; therefore, she wants her friends to confirm the resemblance between herself and Katherine. Betty is a highly conservative student and generally criticizes Watson's teaching method. Therefore, she answers Giselle's question with a cynical question to humiliate Watson's interpretation of art because she shows

the students Soutine's painting *Carcass of Beef* that students do not consider a product of real art. This example is the representation of Watson's innovative approach to the interpretation of different products of art, and it demonstrates Watson's libertarian nature both in her life and in her job.

The French dubbing in this example is the literal translation of the dialogue and it contains all information and feminist messages in the movie because the French question is the exact equivalence of Betty's question in English. Therefore, the French version of the dialogue effectively represents Katherine's professional perspective on art. However, the Turkish dubbing effaces the professional interpretation of art in the dialogue because Betty's question is translated as "Ms. Wiseacre, you mean?" [back translation of Turkish dubbing], which shows that there is not a single reference to Watson's profession or her interpretation of art. According to Lazar's FCDA, the Turkish version of the example destroys the feminist ideology of the movie since it does not include any information about Watson's professional quality; instead, the Turkish dubbing creates a know-all image for the professor regardless of her educational background, her capacity, and her liberal perspective.

Table 3. Example 3 for FCDA in Mona Lisa Smile and its French and Turkish Dubbed Versions

ST (English)	• Ladies' choice? (39' 45") • Sure! (Newell 2003)
TT- French	• L'honneur aux dames? • Bien sûr!
TT- Turkish	• Dans edelim mi? • Tabii!

In this dialogue, Giselle wants to dance with Bill Dunbar, the Italian professor. So, she says "Ladies' choice?" to invite him to dance. This question indicates that it is a woman's turn to decide with whom she will dance and it symbolizes the strength of women in their personal choices; therefore, the sentence has a significant impact on the feminist perspective of the movie. In the French dubbing, a similar impact has been created by translating the sentence as "l'honneur aux dames?" ("would you do me, a woman, the honor?" [back translation]). Since the French translation includes a reference to the female sex of the inviter, it can be stated that the French dubbing preserves the feminist perspective of the movie. However, in Turkish dubbing, the reference to the sex of the interlocutors has been eliminated since the question has been translated as "Shall we dance?" (back translation). Accordingly, the Turkish translation does not reflect the strong position of the woman in deciding on her dancing partner. Hence, it can be remarked within the scope of Lazar's FCDA that Turkish dubbing has caused another loss in the feminist perspective of the movie whereas the French version has managed to preserve the ideological messages.

Table 4. Example 4 for FCDA in *Mona Lisa Smile* and its French and Turkish Dubbed Versions

ST (English)	• You are this close to getting everything you ever wanted. And this close to losing it! 51' 16" (Newell 2003)
TT- French	• Tu es à ça d'avoir tous ce que tu as toujours voulu. Et à ça de le perdre!
TT- Turkish	• İnanamıyorum. Her şeyini birden kaybetmek mi istiyorsun? Üstelik bu kadar yaklaşmışken!

Joan Brandwyn, Betty's best friend, says that she applied to Yale Law School and got accepted to it. Betty believes that marriage is everything that a girl may want. She harshly criticizes Joan's decision. At the end of this dialogue, Betty Warren underlines that marriage is Joan's dream and is everything she has wanted. French dubbing is the literal translation of the sentence; no change is needed in the structure or word choice while translating the sentence into French since both languages have similar grammar and syntax, and it is possible to find the equivalences of the terms. Therefore, the utmost meaning attributed to marriage in this sentence is effectively preserved in the French translation. Turkish dubbing, however, has significantly changed the meaning of the sentence. The back translation of the Turkish sentence is "I can't believe it. Do you want to lose everything you have? And you're so close!" As can be understood from this back translation, there is no reference to the significance of marriage because Joan is not married yet so marriage is not something that she has. No reference is given to Joan's biggest objective to get married. Moreover, it is not clear what is so close if she has already had "everything". Accordingly, it can be stated that French dubbing manages to create the same message by emphasizing the importance of marriage for the students whereas Turkish dubbing has caused significant losses in the reflection of underlying messages and the feminist perspective of the movie.

Table 5. Example 5 for FCDA in *Mona Lisa Smile* and its French and Turkish Dubbed Versions

ST (English)	• "Make an honest man out of me". (54' 22") (Newell 2003)
TT- French	• "Ne m'obliges pas à vivre dans le péché".
TT- Turkish	• "Lütfen benimle evlen".

This dialogue occurs between Katherine and her boyfriend. While having dinner, her boyfriend wishes to propose to her. But in this dialogue, he prefers to use the sentence "make an honest man out of me" instead of the classical sentence "marry me". This specific phrase plays a significant role in reflecting the feminist perspective of the movie because this expression is generally used for women ("to make an honest woman out of someone") and it means "to marry a woman, especially when you have already had a long (sexual) relationship with

her" ("Make an Honest Woman (out) of Someone," 2023). In this sense, we see that marriage clears the bad reputation of a woman. However, in the movie, it is the woman who will clear the name of the man, which attributes an important role and identity to the female character. For this reason, it is crucial to create the same message in translations.

The back translation of the French dubbing is "Don't make me live in sin". Since the man utters this sentence, this proposal also has a similar meaning to the original version of the discourse, because the woman will save the honour of the man in this version, as well. It can be stated that the French version has preserved the feminist discourse by emphasizing the strength of women and turning the female character into an active decision-maker rather than a passive agent. In the Turkish version, all gender-based references have been deleted, and the phrase has been translated as "Please, marry me" (back translation). The omission of the underlying networks of significance in the translation has caused the elimination of the feminist perspective of the movie in the Turkish version.

Table 6. Example 6 for FCDA in *Mona Lisa Smile* and its French and Turkish Dubbed Versions

Source Text (ST [English])	• "Don't disregard our traditions just because you are subversive". (60'17") (Newell 2003)
Target Text (TT- French)	• "Ne bousculez pas nos traditions sous prétexte que vous êtes subversive".
Target Text (TT- Turkish)	• "Size ters geliyor diye lütfen geleneklerimizle alay etmeyin".

Betty gets married, and she is absent in numerous classes of the history of art. When she returns to school after a while, Katherine says that Betty may fail the course because she has not handed her papers in. The students inform the teacher that the faculty let a student skip several classes and papers if she gets married. Finding it quite illogical, Katherine Watson asks why the students do not marry as freshmen so that they can graduate from school without even going to the campus. At this point, as a highly conservative student, Betty challenges the professor and she defines Katherine as "a subversive person" aiming to "destroy or damage an established system" ("Subversive," 2023). This word choice illustrates Watson's feminist and rebellious nature.

French dubbing is the literal translation of the sentence, and the exact equivalence of the word "subversive" has been used in the French version ("subversive" [feminine form of the adjective subversif]). Therefore, no loss of the underlying message has been observed in the French version. However, in Turkish dubbing, the rebellious character of the protagonist is lost because the sentence doesn't include any reference to the feminist perspective. The back translation of

the Turkish sentence given in Example 6 is "Please don't mock our traditions because they are against your opinion". Turkish dubbing seriously diminishes the power that Katherine possesses to make a difference by destroying conservative traditions which limit the capacities of women. Accordingly, the Turkish translation has caused the elimination of the feminist perspective in the movie.

Table 7. Example 7 for FCDA in *Mona Lisa Smile* and its French and Turkish Dubbed Versions

ST (English)	• "You don't believe in withholding, do you?" (66' 29") (Newell 2003)
TT- French	• "Vous ne tenez pas à faire des cachotteries?"
TT- Turkish	• "Bekarete önem vermiyorsunuz, değil mi?".

In time, students start to like Katherine; therefore, they invite her to a special meeting to get more information about her private life. They talk about her plan for marriage and learn that she and her boyfriend have broken up. Getting a chance to humiliate Ms. Watson, Betty forces her to talk about Bill Dunbar, the Italian professor, and her "relationship" with him. To make her reveal the secret relationship, Betty asks the question given in Example 7. This question is asked by a student to a teacher, and it means that Watson is not a person keeping secrets. Therefore, the French dubbing of the question contains a similar meaning by referring to Betty's effort to learn Watson's secrets (You don't want to keep secrets? [back translation of the French dubbing]). Accordingly, the French translation clearly illustrates the respectful relationship between a student and a teacher, and it conveys the main message by asking for the revelation of a possible relationship between two professors within the scope of good manners.

The Turkish translation has changed the content to a great extent because the original question is possibly misunderstood by the translator. The back translation of the Turkish question is "You don't believe in virginity, do you?", and this translation causes a significant deterioration in the quality of the dialogue. The Turkish dubbing creates an image that a student accuses her teacher of not having moral values whereas there is no reference to a sexual relationship between the two professors. Such translation destroys the feminist perspective of the movie since it creates a negative image of Katherine's personality. Turkish dubbing cannot preserve the ideological messages given in the original movie.

Table 8. Example 8 for FCDA in *Mona Lisa Smile* and its French and Turkish Dubbed Versions

ST (English)	• "While our mothers were called to work for Lady Liberty, …" (67' 59") (Newell 2003)
TT- French	• "Tandis que nos meres avaient été appelées au travail pour défendre la liberté…"
TT- Turkish	• "Annelerimize özgürlüğü koruma çağrısı yapılmıştı…"

After learning about Katherine's private life and her support for Joan's being accepted by Yale Law School, Betty writes an article in a local newspaper to criticize Katherine's liberal ideas and her "unacceptable motives" to change the perspectives of Wellesley girls. She states that their mothers have been expected to work for the USA. The word "to work" is quite important here because it illustrates Betty's conflicting ideas stating that women have been expected to work but advocating that women are supposed to serve their husbands and raise their children. The French dubbing gives the very same message because the original structure of the sentence is preserved as much as possible, and each word of the original text has been translated into French without any omission ("While our mothers were called to work for defending the liberty" [back translation]). In this way, the French version of the movie manages to demonstrate Betty's conflict and it reflects the feminist messages in the movie.

The Turkish dubbing of the sentence causes another loss in the feminist perspective because it does not contain the word "to work". The back translation of Turkish dubbing is "our mothers were called upon to protect freedom", and in this sentence, there is no information about how they are supposed to protect it. Accordingly, the most significant message of the sentence has been deleted in the Turkish version, which destroys the ideological references of the movie.

Table 9. Example 9 for FCDA in *Mona Lisa Smile* and its French and Turkish Dubbed Versions

ST (English)	• "It is our duty, nay, obligation to reclaim our place in the home, bearing the children that will carry our traditions into the future". (68' 02") (Newell 2003)
TT- French	• "C'est pour nous un devoir, que dis-je, une obligation de reprendre notre place au foyer et d'enfanter ceux qui défendront nos traditions à l'avenir".
TT- Turkish	• "Bizim görevimiz evimizdeki sorumluluklarımızı yerine getirip geleneklerimizi taşıyacak çocuklar yetiştirmek".

This sentence is the continuation of Warren's article. Once again, Betty Warren emphasizes the "expectations" of society from women as wives and mothers. The sharpness of her expressions demonstrates how deeply she defends the patriarchal order in society, as seen in her word choices (e.g., obligation). The French dubbing is the literal translation of the original sentence and it effectively reflects the density of this patriarchal perspective since the transfer from "our duty" to "our obligation" is identically made in the French version. Nevertheless, in Turkish dubbing, the density of the words has decreased to a great extent because the word "obligation" has been omitted ("our duty is to fulfill our responsibilities at home and raise children who will carry our traditions" [back translation]). Although this article plays a significant role in the plot of the movie aiming to demonstrate the dominant

patriarchal order in society, this omission has caused a significant loss in the reflection of feminist ideology.

Table 10. Example 10 for FCDA in *Mona Lisa Smile* and its French and Turkish Dubbed Versions

ST (English)	• "Her subversive and political teachings encourage our Wellesley girls to reject the roles they were born to fill. (68' 11") (Newell 2003)
TT- French	• "Son enseignement subversif et politisé encourage les étudiantes de Wellesley à refuser de jouer le rôle pour lequel elles sont nées".
TT- Turkish	• "Onun aykırı ve politik öğretileri yüzünden Wellesley kızları kendilerine düşen sorumlulukları yerine getirmek istemiyor".

This example is also included in the article written by Betty. In this sentence, she mentions Katherine by criticizing the "negative influence" of her mindset on Wellesley girls because they start to show interest in being active in professional life. Just like other examples, the word choices are important to reflect the patriarchal point of view of the relevant group. Betty, her family, teachers, and some of her friends find Katherine's ideas dangerous; therefore, they define her as a "subversive teacher" wishing to destroy their traditions. Moreover, this example emphasizes how girls should internalize the role that society has chosen for them. As seen in the example, "girls were born to fill these roles".

In French dubbing, it is seen that the sentence has been translated into French in a literal form, which means that no change or loss is observed in the translated version. The adjective "subversive" and the phrase "…the roles they were born to fill" have been translated into French word for word. In this way, all ideological components have been well-preserved. In Turkish dubbing, on the other hand, the density of the words and phrases has been lost once again because the above-mentioned adjective and phrase have been changed. The back translation of the Turkish sentence is "because of her contrary and political teachings, the Wellesley girls do not want to fulfill their responsibilities", in which the connotations of the adjective "subversive" and the phrase "the roles they were born to fill" have been completely lost. Due to this loss, the strength of the discourse has been diminished, which destroys the feminist perspective in the movie.

Concluding Discussion

The approach of feminism aims to change "the claim of the universal patriarchy" by creating a "universal redefinition of women" emphasizing their increasing potential and enhanced social status (Butler, 1990). Although this struggle is generally observed in almost all societies, it should be acknowledged that it is quite chal-

lenging to create a universal feminine identity due to cultural differences. In line with this universal problem, this article has aimed to illustrate the efficiency of the transfer of feminist ideology in different dubbings of the selected movie by analysing the original discourse and translations within the scope of Lazar's FCDA. When the data discussed above are taken into consideration, it is seen that the French dubbing of each example has effectively transferred the feminist ideology to the target audience. It is considered that the main factor in this success of transfer is based on the resemblance between the two languages, namely English and French. The grammatical order is quite similar and there are numerous common words, which makes it easier to convey the message without causing any distortion or loss. These findings are considered to be novelistic because the literature has generally supported that certain losses in the transfer of feminist concepts are observed in the translation process (Alfano, 2018; De Marco, 2006, 2012, Feral, 2011; Sehyoun, 2017).

Turkish dubbing, on the other hand, has caused significant losses and distortions in all examples analysed above. The densities of the words have significantly decreased, the feminist connotations in the examples have been generally lost, and certain translation mistakes have caused the effacement of underlying connotative networks.

The main causes of these critical translation problems are the structural differences between the two languages as well as the limited capacity of the translator in understanding and in conveying ideological messages in the discourses. Similar to the literature, significant losses have occurred in the transfer of feminist discourse in the translation process due to structural difference of the source language and the target language and the cultural divergences between the source language society and the target language society (Alfano, 2018; De Marco, 2006, 2012, Feral, 2011; Sehyoun, 2017). In this case, it is seen that the translator does not reflect the feminist ideology and the criticism of the patriarchal order; therefore, significant losses and mistakes have been made during the translation process. Translators as intercultural agents (Martínez-Sierra, 2010) should effectively understand and interpret the sociocultural connotations in the translation process by benefitting from their social and cultural awareness. However, in our case, such understanding and interpretation could not be observed in the Turkish dubbing of the movie.

A feminist approach to translation has the potential to reveal many overlooked or suppressed aspects of a text (Massardier-Kenney, 1997, p. 65). Languages reflect different worldviews and cultures and there are various types of expression specific to a relevant language (Doğan 1995, p. 74). These realities are the factors that turn the translational act into a difficult and professional process. Besides, there is a concern about increasing focus on gender inequality in literary translations and in audiovisual translations (De Marco, 2006, 2012; Dinan et al., 2020; Von Flotow & Josephy-Hernández, 2018; Wang et al., 2020). Accordingly, translators are supposed

to have a good command of analysis and synthesis, and they should grasp the ideological references in all types of texts. Lazar has indicated that "two important insights for a feminist CDA have been the recognition of difference and diversity among 'women' (and 'men') and the pervasiveness of the subtle, discursive workings of modern power in many modern societies" (Lazar, 2007b, p. 9). In our research, these insights have shown the presence of overlooked ideological problems in the translated discourses, especially in the Turkish language. In our case study, it has been concluded that the French translator has been equipped with the necessary skills and s/he has benefitted from the advantages of the languages whereas the Turkish translator has not understood the feminist references given in the audiovisual product.

After all these analyses and discussions in the light of FCDA in Translation Studies, we might conclude that ideological references play a significant role in conveying the real message of a movie, and it is a must to protect the same message in the translated or dubbed versions of the same product. Otherwise, the main aim of the movie will be lost in other cultures, and it becomes a meaningless product for the target audience. The losses of feminist connotations in the translated product may influence the perception of the audience about the feminist approach in the movie. In this sense, various studies may be conducted on the perception of the target audience. A feminist perspective on the translated versions of movies and the analysis of the perception of the target audience will shed more light on the debate on whether the field of translation reinforces gender stereotypes.

Disclosure statement

The authors report there are no competing interests to declare.

References | Список литературы

Alfano, V. (2018). Different Gender Stereotypes for Different Subtitles: Divorce–Italian Style. *Cultus*, 1, 77–95.

Baumgarten, N. (2005). On the women's service?: Gender-conscious language in dubbed James Bond movies. In J. Santaemilia (Ed.), *Gender, sex, and translation: The manipulation of identities* (pp. 53–70). St. Jerome Pub.

Butler, J. (1990). *Gender trouble: Feminism and the subversion of identity*. Routledge.

Carter, C. (2012). Sex/Gender and the Media: From Sex Roles to Social Construction and Beyond. In K. Ross (Ed.), *The handbook of gender, sex, and media* (pp. 365–382). Wiley-Blackwell. https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118114254.ch22

Castro, O. (2013). Introduction: Gender, language and translation at the crossroads of disciplines. *Gender and Language*, 7(1), 5–12. https://doi.org/10.1558/genl.v7i1.5

ÇeliK, K. (2022). Çeviride kadın izi: Feminist çeviri stratejileri. *RumeliDE Dil ve Edebiyat Araştırmaları Dergisi*, *27*, 853–868. https://doi.org/10.29000/rumelide.1106163

Chamberlain, L. (1988). Gender and the Metaphorics of Translation. *Signs*, 13(3), 454–472. https://doi.org/10.1086/494428

Corrius Gimbert, M., De Marco, M., & Espasa Borrás, E. (2016). Gender and the translation of audiovisual non-profit advertising. *Revista de Lenguas Para Fines Específicos*, *22*(2). https://doi.org/10.20420/rlfe.2016.316

Corrius, M., De Marco, M., & Espasa, E. (2016). Situated learning and situated knowledge: Gender, translating audiovisual adverts and professional responsibility. *The Interpreter and Translator Trainer*, 10(1), 59–75. https://doi.org/10.1080/1750399X.2016.1154343

De Marco, M. (2006). Audiovisual Translation from a Gender Perspective. *The Journal of Specialised Translation*, *6*, 167–184.

De Marco, M. (2012). *Audiovisual translation through a gender lens.* Rodopi. https://doi.org/10.1163/9789401207881

De Marco, M. (2018). The "engendering" approach in audiovisual translation. In Y. Gambier & S. Ramos Pinto (Eds.), *Benjamins Current Topics* (Vol. 95, pp. 133–144). John Benjamins Publishing Company. https://doi.org/10.1075/bct.95.11dem

Díaz Cintas, J. (2004). In search of a theoretical framework for the study of audiovisual translation. In P. Orero (Ed.), *Benjamins Translation Library* (Vol. 56, pp. 21–34). John Benjamins Publishing Company. https://doi.org/10.1075/btl.56.06dia

Dinan, E., Fan, A., Wu, L., Weston, J., Kiela, D., & Williams, A. (2020). Multi-Dimensional Gender Bias Classification. *Proceedings of the 2020 Conference on Empirical Methods in Natural Language Processing (EMNLP)*, 314–331. https://doi.org/10.18653/v1/2020.emnlp-main.23

Doğan, A. (1995). *Her Yönüyle Dil: Ana Çizgileriyle Dilbilim [Language in All Its Aspects: Linguistics with Outlines]*. Türk Dil Kurumu Publishing. (In Turkish).

Dore, M., & Zarrelli, I. (2018). Transfeminine identity and HIV/AIDS in audiovisual translation Dallas Buyers Club and its Italian subtitled versions. In J. T. Williams Camus, C. G. Castro, A. Assis Rosa, & C. Camus (Eds.), *Translation and gender: Discourse strategies to shape gender* (pp. 59-79). Cantabria University Press.

Etikan, I., Musa, S. A., & Alkassim, R. S. (2016). Comparison of Convenience Sampling and Purposive Sampling. *American Journal of Theoretical and Applied Statistics*, 5(1), 1. https://doi.org/10.11648/j.ajtas.20160501.11

Fawcet, P. (2003). The Manipulation of Language and Culture in Film Translation. In M. Calzada Pérez (Ed.), *Apropos of ideology: Translation studies on ideology* (pp. 152–171). St. Jerome.

Feral, A.-L. (2011). Gender in audiovisual translation: Naturalizing feminine voices in the French *Sex and the City*. *European Journal of Women's Studies*, 18(4), 391–407. https://doi.org/10.1177/1350506811415199

Godard, B. (1989). Theorizing Feminist Discourse / Translation. *Tessera*, *6*, 42–53. https://doi.org/10.25071/1923-9408.23583

Hooks, B. (2012). *Feminizm herkes içindir: Tutkulu politika [Feminism is for everyone: Passionate politics]* (E. Aydın, B. Kurt, S. Özgün, & A. Yıldırım, Trans.). Boğaziçi Gösteri Sanatları Topluluğu. (In Turkish).

In Cambridge Dictionary. (2023). Companion. https://dictionary.cambridge.org/.

In Larousse Dictionnaire. (2024). Compagnon. https://www.larousse.fr/dictionnaires/francais/compagnon/17597#:~:text=%EE%A0%AC%20compagnon&text=Celui%20qui%20vit%20ordinairement%20auprès,ses%20occupations%20%3A%20Compagnon%20de%20captivité.&text=3.,autre%20%3A%20Compagnon%20d'infortune.

In Legal Services Commission. (2023). Companion Relationship. https://lawhandbook.sa.gov.au/ch21s05s07.php#:~:text=A%20companion%20relationship%20is%20a,in%20a%20de%20facto%20relationship.

Josephy, D. E. (2017). *Reflections on the Subtitling and Dubbing of Anime: The Translation of Gender in Perfect Blue, a Film by Kon Satoshi* [PhD Dissertation, Université d'Ottawa / University of Ottawa]. http://hdl.handle.net/10393/36596

Khan, H. (2019). A Feminist Critical Discourse Analysis of Qaisra Shahraz's The Holy Woman in the Backdrop of Subalternity. *International Journal of English Linguistics*, 9(5), 249. https://doi.org/10.5539/ijel.v9n5p249

Lazar, M. M. (2007a). Feminist Critical Discourse Analysis: Articulating a Feminist Discourse Praxis1. *Critical Discourse Studies*, 4(2), 141–164. https://doi.org/10.1080/17405900701464816

Lazar, M. M. (Ed.). (2007b). *Feminist critical discourse analysis: Gender, power and ideology in discourse* (Paperback). Palgrave Macmillan.

Make an honest woman (out) of someone. (2023). In *Cambridge Dictionary*. https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/make-an-honest-woman-out-of?q=make+an+honest+woman

Martínez-Sierra, J. J. (2010). Building Bridges Between Cultural Studies and Translation Studies: With Reference to the Audiovisual Field. *Journal of Universal Language*, 11(1), 115–136. https://doi.org/10.22425/jul.2010.11.1.115

Massardier-Kenney, F. (1997). Towards a Redefinition of Feminist Translation Practice. *The Translator*, 3(1), 55–69. https://doi.org/10.1080/13556509.1997.10798988

Nardi, V. (2011). The Translation of Gender Stereotypes in Advertising. In F. Eleonora (Ed.), *Translating Gender* (pp. 117–127). Peter Lang.

Nartey, M. (2021). A feminist critical discourse analysis of Ghanaian feminist blogs. *Feminist Media Studies*, 21(4), 657–672. https://doi.org/10.1080/14680777.2020.1837910

Newell, M. (Director). (2004). *Mona Lisa Smile* [Video recording]. Columbia Pictures.

Okyayuz, A. Ş. (2022). Multilingualism, communication and translation: An analysis of the crosscultural transfer of audiovisual products from a translation studies perspective. *RumeliDE Journal of Language and Literature Studies*, 30, 1304–1320. https://doi.org/10.29000/rumelide.1192530

Okyayuz, A. Ş., & Kaya, M. (2017). *Görsel İşitsel Çeviri Eğitimi [Audiovisual Translation Training]*. Siyasal Publishing. (In Turkish).

Sehyoun, K. (2017). Gender Portrayed in Audiovisual Translation: Focusing on Disney Movies. *Children's Literature and Translation*, 33, 61–82.

Simon, S. (1996). *Gender in translation: Cultural identity and the politics of transmission.* Routledge.

Smelik, A. (2008). *Feminist Sinema ve Film Teorisi ve Ayna Çatladı [Feminist Cinema and Film Theory and The Mirror is Cracked]* (D. Koç, Trans.). Agorakitaplığı. (In Turkish).

Subversive. (2023). In *Cambridge Dictionary*. https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/subversive

Von Flotow, L. (1991). Feminist Translation: Contexts, Practices and Theories. *TTR: traduction, terminologie, rédaction*, 4(2), 69. https://doi.org/10.7202/037094ar

Von Flotow, L. (1995). Beginnings of a European Project: Feminisms and Translation Studies. *TTR: traduction, terminologie, rédaction*, 8(1), 271. https://doi.org/10.7202/037205ar

Von Flotow, L. (1997). *Translation and Gender*. University of Ottawa Press.

Von Flotow, L., & Josephy-Hernández, D. E. (2018). Gender in audiovisual translation studiesAdvocating for gender awareness. In L. Pérez González (Ed.), *The Routledge handbook of audiovisual translation* (pp. 296–311). Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315717166-19

Wang, Y., Yu, X., & Chen, Q. (2020). Translation and negotiation of gender stereotypes: Metamorphosis of female characters in the English version of a Chinese classical novel. *Perspectives*, 28(5), 702–716. https://doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2019.1663887